

October 4, 1962

Mr. Cornelius C. Moore 112 Bellevue Avenue Newport, Rhode Island

Dear Mr. Moore:

While this tankard has the characteristics of early New York tankards soon after 1700, the mark does not comply with the known Bartholomew Schaats mark both as illustrated in the books of marks and as shown by our impressions from actual examples. The absence of the star or crude fleur-de-lis below the initials in the heart is definite, and also the difference of the face, angles and position of the initials is apparent. We have impressions taken from two Schaats porringers, one in the Yale Gallery of Fine Arts, the other belonging to a local private owner. The Simeon Soumain premise taken from seeing the B as a closed S, the back line of the B partially indiscernible, is also not supported by any record that I can find to the extent of present review, of Soumain's using a heart shape mark. The unerased condition would promote the question whether the tankard came down unmarked and a mark applied which would be fictitious although on the right track for attribution.

The details I observed as peculiarities of the tankard marked I R, I find are such as appear on New York tankards by William Anderson, also by Elias Pelletreau. Anderson apprenticed to Simeon Soumain 1719-26, made silver for Livingstons. Pelletreau, of Southampton, apprenticed to Simeon Soumain in 1741 when 15 years old, completed 1748, admitted Freeman of the City of New York 1750.

Coins through lids are found in New York tankards by Garret Onkelbag, Simeon Soumain, and John Hastier. The last named would be a candidate if it appeared the mark #R were actually # H, and in a rectangle instead of a rather oval outline. The sketch I took of the # R mark indicates a definite second initial R and with its leg as I observed not incurved, and going in at the middle, that is not like the straight upright of an H.

Mr. Cornelius C. Moore October 4, 1962 It was a pleasure to revisit pieces in your collection formerly familiar to me here as well as to have a look at the numerous other prizes you have gathered. Perhaps the house itself so tastefully refurbished and furnished, displaying the silver in some such way as I saw it, although necessarily out of reach of all comers, should be perpetuated as a museum. It was a fine day to make the trip and I am glad I chose to do so. I can imagine you had an enjoyable evening checking the contents that were so compactly boxed. Thank you again for your "time off" with me, and again for your kind cooperation in accord with my recent request for the personal account and in making the two further payments. Very truly yours, GEBELEIN SILVERSMITHS, INC. By Abelet Gelelein G/P